



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

The Latin text has :

Ad hec tirannus, dolos in pectore versans, ne a circumstantibus tamquam iniquus et inplacabilis accusaretur, ait puelle, etc.¹

The *Danza de la Muerte*, I, reads :

Pues non ay tan fuerte njn Rezio gigante
Que d' este mj arco se puede anparar ?
Conuiene que mueras quando lo tirar
Con esta mj frecha cruel traspasante.

In commenting on *quando lo tirar*, Ford, following Appel, says : "This is an interesting early use of *quando* as a preposition." He refers to Bello's discussion of such phrases as *quando la guerra* and to the English "we did it when children." Without considering the question of a possible prepositional use of *quando*, the interpretation of the phrase in the *Danza* as 'at the time of the shooting' offers difficulties. If *tirar* is a verbal noun we should expect the masculine article *el*, not the neuter *lo*. It seems more probable that *lo* is the object pronoun referring to *arco* of the preceding line, and *tirar* is the apocopated first person singular of the future subjunctive *tirare*. This interpretation is strengthened somewhat by the reading of the 1520 edition :

Conviene que muera, si he de poner
contra él mi flecha en el traspasante.

In the *Danza de la Muerte*, XLIII, Death addresses to the dishonest lawyer the following words :

El Chino e el Bartolo e el Coletario
Non vos librarán de mj poder mero.

As the identity of "el Coletario" still remains an unsolved riddle, the following item and suggestion may be of interest. About the middle of the fifteenth century Juan Martinez de Burgos in a poem on the corruption of the law courts of his time, states that

Viene el pleito á disputacion,
Alli es Bártolo, é Chino, *Digesto*,
Juan Andrés é Baldo, Enrique, do son
Mas opiniones que uvas en cesto.²

¹ Knust, *Geschichte der Legenden der h. Katharina von Alexandrien und der h. Maria Aegyptiaca, nebst unedierten Texten*, Halle, 1890, p. 289.

² Cf. *Memorias históricas de la vida y acciones del Rey D. Alonso VIII*, Madrid, 1783, p. cxxv.

Note that the two poems are treating the same theme and that the *Digesto*, or Justinian *Digest*, takes the place of *el Coletario* in its direct association with Chino and Bartolo.

C. CARROLL MARDEN.

Johns Hopkins University.

CORRESPONDENCE

SOME INCONSISTENCIES IN *Salammbô*

To the Editors of *Mod. Lang. Notes*.

SIRS:—In the *Revue d'Histoire Littéraire de la France* for 1910 (p. 395) "H. L." published some "Petites Notes Vétilleuses sur Mme. Bovary." During a careful reading of *Salammbô*¹ for another purpose I was struck by some inconsistencies of detail that are quite as curious as the vagaries remarked by H. L. in the schedule of *l'Hirondelle* between Yonville and Rouen.

First of all, the question of language in *Salammbô* is a complicated one. When *Salammbô* appeared at the banquet of the Mercenaries she chanted the adventures of Melkarth "dans un vieil idiome chananéen que n'entendaient pas les Barbares. Seuls les prêtres sans barbe comprenaient" (p. 14). Then follow the words of her song. But later when Mâtho was suffering the torments of love at Sicca he remembered the scene and chanted the story in the self-same words (p. 35). Flaubert (p. 368) reproached M. Froehner with falsifying the "is omnes linguas scit" of Plautus so as to make universal polyglots of the Carthaginians, yet, at the banquet, his heroine, a maiden reared in retirement, "employait simultanément tous les idiomes des Barbares" (p. 15). Furthermore the slave who, later, guided her to the barbarian camp replied in the proper tongue to each band of hostile stragglers that they met (p. 215).

It is not only the Carthaginians who had

¹ The references are to the Charpentier edition, Paris, 1910.

this gift of tongues. At almost our first glimpse of Spendius he is speaking Greek, Ligurian, and Punic (p. 7), and tho we are assured that the Mercenaries knew no Phoenician (p. 40), yet during the siege the townsmen were harassed by projectiles from the slingers, with words stamped on them: "attrape!"; "je l'ai bien mérité" (p. 273). Now if these legends were in Barbarian tongues it is but another evidence of the linguistic ability of the Carthaginians.

Not infrequently Flaubert loses sight of the point of view in his descriptions. At the close of the first chapter Spendius and Mâtho, from the terrace of the palace, descry a body moving on the horizon: "un point d'or tournait *au loin* dans la poussière. C'était le moyeu d'un char attelé de deux mulets. *Les crinières des bêtes bouffaient entre leurs oreilles à la mode persique, sous un réseau de perles bleues*" (p. 21).

Again this is evident in what was beheld by the solitary spectator, "le Carthaginois qui regardait *penché au haut du précipice*," when he looked down into the Défilé de la Hache where the lions were finishing up the trapped Barbarians: "alors un des lions se mit à marcher, *découpant avec sa forme monstrueuse une ombre noire sur le fond du ciel pourpre*" (p. 341).

Sainte-Beuve (*Nouveaux Lundis*, iv, p. 66) girded at Flaubert because of the figures given for the sum total of Hamilcar's army—11,396 (p. 170).² The author replied tartly: "mais vous venez de le voir vous-même, puisque j'ai dit le nombre d'hommes qu'il y avait dans les différents corps de l'armée punique. C'est le total tout bonnement" (p. 358). But the sum total actually is 10,396 (p. 162).

The reader is somewhat surprised at the secret beginning (p. 125) and public ending (p. 137) of the Council of the Ancients, and quite amazed at the conduct of the sacred lions in the temple of Moloch: "ils sommeillaient, les paupières entre-closes. Mais réveillés . . . ils venaient vers les Anciens, *qu'ils reconnaissaient à leur costume, se frottaient contre leurs*

cuisse en bombant le dos avec des bâillements sonores" (p. 126); and, tho flowers were in blossom (p. 139), "la vapeur de leur haleine passait sur la lumière des torches."

The angry Hamilcar condemned to death Giddenem (p. 157) and Abdalonim (p. 159), but they appear again alive (p. 285).

The excellence of the discipline in the Punic army seems exaggerated in the scene that closes the battle of the Macar. There is a marvelous description of battle tumult and the beginning of a headlong pursuit. Hamilcar appeared and "d'un mouvement de sa pique à trois pointes il arrêta l'armée" (p. 176).

It was no doubt surprising to Mâtho, attempting to escape with the zaïmph, to find the streets already barred with ropes, chariots, and snares (p. 93).

Despite the vividness of the picture there is something smile-provoking in "un Lusitanien, de taille gigantesque, portant un homme au bout de chaque bras, parcourait les tables tout en crachant du feu par les narines" (p. 6); and again in the final sentence of the paragraph describing the weapons of the savage tribes that came to aid the Barbarians (p. 253): "D'autres, les mains vides, *faisaient claquer leurs dents*."

The reader finds difficulty in accepting the fact that Salammbô did not perceive the symptoms of the serpent's malady (p. 198) to be due merely to the time having come for him to cast his skin—too much difficulty to justify Flaubert in using her ignorance of this as an important means of leading up to the journey to the Barbarian camp in the following chapter.

When we remember the enormous care that Flaubert bestowed on the writing of *Salammbô*, such inconsistencies, such disparities as these are surprising. On the other hand, this very expenditure of labor resulted in composition by scenes, even by paragraphs, rather than by movements or by chapters. This left openings for slips. Furthermore, it is evident that one of his methods of building up his wonderful descriptive passages was to accumulate vivid details, and to clamp on at the close some striking item or image that nails the picture, as it were, motionless before the mind's eye. Thus,

²This same total is given also in the first edition of *Salammbô*.

if we omit the vanishing chariot, the lion's silhouette against the purple background, the snap-shot of Hamilcar with raised staff halting the Carthaginian army, the unarmed savages clicking their teeth, we omit so many fine pictures, and if Flaubert had produced what he called his "facétie truculente" free of inconsistencies it would in all likelihood not be the resurrection of Carthage that his five years' toil made of it.

A. COLEMAN.

The Johns Hopkins University.

THE FIFTEEN CONDITIONS OF A GOOD HORSE

To the Editors of Mod. Lang. Notes.

SIRS:—In his edition of the *Harrowing of Hell* (EETS., Ext. Ser. C, p. xxv, note), Professor Hulme reprinted from ms. Lansdowne 762, a list of the Fifteen Conditions of a good horse. With this may be compared the following bit preserved in Trin. Coll. Camb. ms. O. 9. 38, fol. 49^a:

"here be gynnyth xvtē condycyons that a goode hors schulde haue.

A goode hors schulde haue iij condycyons of a man. iij of a woman. iij of a fox. iij of an hare. and iij of an Asse. The iij of a man to be prowte boolde and hardy. The iij of a woman to haue a faeyr breste a fayer creste and eesy to lepe vpon. The iij of the fox to haue schort eerys a feeyr tayle and a goode trotte. The iij of the hare to haue a lene hede greet yeen and wel rennyng away. The iij of the asse to haue bygge chyne a flat leg and a goode hofe. &c."

A variant of these Fifteen Conditions is to be recognized in the following sentence, which is taken from the *Four Bookes of Husbandry*, collected by M. Conradus Heresbachius . . . Newly Englished and increased by Barnabe Googe, Esquire, London, 1577, fol. 115 (wrongly printed "113") verso:

"Some horsemen would haue their Horse to be limmed after the proporcion of diuers Beastes, as to haue the head and legges, of a Stagge, the eares and tayle, of a Fox, the necke, of a Swanne, the brest, of a Lion, the buttockes, of a Woman, and the fete of an Asse."

There is also a variant of the same catalogue—

in which the number of properties is the same—printed in Claudio Corte's *Il Cavallerizzo* (Venice, 1573, Lib. I, cap. 22):—

(fol. 32^b) "Dal lupo adunque piglia gli occhi, la uoracità & le forze dinanzi; Dalla uolpe l'orechie picciole, la coda lunga, & folta, & l'andar greue et soaue; Dalla donna caua il petto, la superbia, & le chiome. Benche alcuni gli potrebbono aggiungere il piacere, & la patientia, che ha di essere caualcata. Et altri gli attribuiscono di piu due altre uirtù; del lepore, cioe, la uelocità & l'agilità; & del Leone la generosità, la fortezza, & l'animo."

CARLETON BROWN.

London, England.

LA PHONÉTIQUE CASTILLANE.

To the Editors of Mod. Lang. Notes.

SIRS:—We should like to explain that the persons used as subjects, or models for our study, *La Phonétique Castillane*, were for the most part graduates of the Madrid and Valladolid Universities and Normal Schools, or professors in those schools. The pronunciation of the educated class is therefore the basis of our study. Our phonetic notations represent that pronunciation except where otherwise stated.

Excluding the nasal vowels, M. Passy finds fifteen vowels in French, and we present sixteen for Castilian. (Passy, *Les Sons du Fr.*, pp. 85, 87, 89; and the Tableau in the *Exposé des Principes de l'Association Phon. Int.*)

M. A. COLTON.

Annapolis, Md.

LETTER OF VOLTAIRE

To the Editors of Mod. Lang. Notes.

SIRS:—The following letter of Voltaire has never, so far as I can discover, been published. I add it to the already voluminous correspondence that seems due to increase each year.¹ The letter is addressed to "Pierre Gosse, libraire à la Haye," bears the month-date, but is "sans millésime."

¹ I owe this letter to the kindness of Dr. T. De Vries of Leyden and the University of Chicago. It has been in his valuable collection of rare books and autographs for many years.